****

**College-Wide Senate General Meeting**

**Savoy Multi-Purpose Room**

**Thursday, February 21, 2019**

**Senate Meeting Minutes**

**Present:**

* **Allied Health:** Professors Sandra Castellanos, Manny Livingston, Ronette Shaw
* **Behavioral and Social Sciences:** Professors Ernest Ialongo (Chairperson), Héctor Soto, Karen Steinmayer
* **Business:** Professors Sandy Figueroa, Claude Fernandez
* **English:** Professors Alexandra Milsom, Tram Nguyen (Vice-Chairperson), Louis Bury
* **Education:** Professors Jacqueline DiSanto, Elys Vazquez-Iscan, Iris Mercado, Michael Gosset
* **Humanities:** Professors Natasha Yannacañedo, Ana Ozuna, Victor Torres-Velez
* **Language & Cognition:**Professors Thomas Mencher, Isabel Feliz
* **Library:**  Professor Jorge Matos
* **Mathematics:** Professors Alexander Vaninsky, Lauren Wolf, A.J. Stachelek
* **Natural Sciences:** Professor John Gillen
* **Higher Education Officers (HEO):** Mr. Terrence Brown, Ms. Yvette Luyando, Ms. Alba Lynch, Ms. Cynthia Morales-Delbrun, Mr. Fabian Wander, Mr. Iber Poma, Ms. Mercedes Moscat, Ms. Carmen Sosa
* **University Faculty Senate (UFS):** Professors Julie Trachman, Gail August, Felipe Pimentel
* **Professional Staff Congress:**  Professor Craig Bernardini
* **Senate At-Large Representatives:** Professors William Casari, James Kennis, Clara Nieto Wire, Sanjay Arya, Sherese Mitchell, Nancy Genova, Mathew Moses, Diana Macri, Thomas Beachdel
* **Student Government Association Representatives (SGA):** President Raziel BenReuben, VP Student Affairs Kelvin Pineda, VP Academic Affairs Ines P. Alejandro-Soriano, Budget and Finance Comm. Djehamou Bly, Evening & PT Comm. Khalifa Diao and Senators Brian Carter, Kaniah Aljamal, Leydi Bautista, Leyddy Ogando, Carlos Diaz, Arafate Idohou, Stephen Kena, Jacqueline Lloyd, Mr. Reynaldo Martinez

**Absent**

* **CLT**: Mr. James Luhan
* **Humanities**- Prof. Isaac Goldemberg
* **Humanities**- Prof. Catherine Lewis
* **Public Safety**- PO Johanna Powell
* **At-Large Representatives**- Professors Andrew Connolly,
* **Adjunct Representatives**- Professors Camilo Almonacid, Pamela Stemberg

**Absent (Excused)**

* **Natural Sciences-**Professor Debasish Roy
* **HEO**- Ms. Safiya Faustin, Mr. Carlos Guevara, Ms. Daliz Perez-Cabezas, Ms. Elizabeth Wilson
* **Student Government Association**- Destini Mitchell-Murray

**Vacant:**

* **Counseling (1)**
* **Gittleson (1)**

**Visitors:**

* + - Professor Hector Lopez, Business Department
    - Professor Sean Gerrity, English Department
    - Associate Dean Ann Mester, OAA
    - Christiana Burton, Student
    - Associate Dean Johana Rivera, Registrar’s Office (SDEM)
    - Carlos Rivera, SDEM
    - Prof. Ruben Worrell, Mathematics Dept.

***1.  Call to Order***

* Quorum established at 38.
* Senate called to order at 3:33 PM.

***2.  Approval of the Agenda***

* Motion duly made to amend item eight (8) of the agenda, Non-Curricular Voting Items, sub-item (c) from Election of two (2) Student Members to the Committee on Committees to one (1) Student.
  + There being no objection or discussion, question called for a vote. Motion to amend agenda approved as stated by unanimous hand vote.
* There being no further discussion, upon motion duly made and approved, the February meeting agenda, as amended, was accepted by acclimation.

***3.  Approval of Thursday, December 20, 2018 College-Wide Senate Minutes***

* Corrections to the December 20, 2018 minutes:
  + HEO’s: Ms. Carmen Sosa was present

Ms. Alba Lynch was an excused absence.

* + There being no further proposed revisions or debate, upon duly made motion, the Minutes of the December 20, 2018 College-Wide Senate Meeting, as revised, were accepted by acclamation.

***4.  Chair’s Remarks***

* Welcome New Allied Health Senator
* Prof. Ronette Shaw
* Thank you Edward King for your service.

* Prof. Hector Soto stepping down from SEC
* Thank you for your service.
* Please fill out the COACHE Survey
* Some changes since the last survey, based on results:
  + CUNY has fellowships available for professors moving toward promotion.
  + They’ve maintained the Chancellor’s Research Fellowship which funds research at the community colleges.
  + At Hostos there has been a series of workshops clarifying tenure and promotion processes, and the Provost and Eugene Sohn visited P and B’s to further clarify these processes.
  + Finally CUNY is launching a training for new chairs.
* Senate Representation on Search Committees
* I’ve spoken to the President and will ensure this takes place.
* Meeting of the Senate Committee Chairpersons
* The meeting went well and will meet again at their request.
* This is a sign of the group coming together.
* Food Labeling Update
* Sent resolution to SVP Rodriguez-Chardavoyne.
* The food is being labeled and they are working to outline the potential allergens.
* We’ll get an update next Senate.
* New Approval Process of Curricular Items
* Committee on Academic Policy, Programs and Research that vets curricular items before vote by the BOT will now have the final word
  + Except for special programs, and extenuating circumstances that require BOT approval
* This will speed up the process of getting things into Chancellor’s Report
* No Hostos items were affected, except a delay in posting during transition, after having passed the Hostos Senate

*The Chair ended his remarks concerning the curricular items by acknowledging and thanking Professor Sandy Figueroa for her dedication and fine work regarding the preparation and presentation of Curricular Items to both the Senate Executive Committee and the College-Wide Senate. Her work and collaboration have been invaluable.*

***5.  President’s Remarks:***

* As concerns the CUNY Chancellor search:
  + The President was pleased to formally announce to the Senate that former Hostos Community College President Félix Matos Rodriguez had been chosen by a unanimous vote of the Board of Trustees to be the seventh Chancellor of the CUNY system.
    - Chancellor Matos Rodriguez will be the first CUNY Chancellor with

community college experience, and it bodes well that his experience was here at Hostos.

* + The President stated that the new Chancellor assumes awesome responsibilities. Even as he builds and solidifies his new administrative team, he will need to organize and conduct five (5) college president searches, each of which requires five (5) Board members although there are currently only 15 total Board members.
  + The President pledged the college’s support for the new Chancellor and expressed confidence that he will do a tremendous job for CUNY and its students.
* As concerns the new CUNY budget:
  + The President reported that the estimated budget shortfall for the next NYS budget is estimated to be 2 to 3 billion dollars.
    - The new Chancellor is already involved in the effort to as a minimum have CUNY stay in place as the hope is not to regress financially rather than move forward.
    - However, there is no cause for immediate alarm and CUNY’s relationship with the Governor remains good.
* As concerns the retirement of Carlos Molina, Vice President of Continuing Education and Workforce Training and Development:
  + The President acknowledged and thanked VP Molina for his years of service to the college and for his abiding friendship.
  + Acknowledged VP Molina for building an outstanding continuing education and workforce development program for Hostos where there was none.
  + Announced and thanked Peter Mertens for agreeing to serve as the Acting VP of Continuing Education and Workforce Training and Development.
* As concerns shared governance and collaboration with the College-wide Senate:
  + The President thanked the Chair and the College-wide Senate for past cooperation and civility especially in light of the present-day political atmosphere.
  + Expressed his hope for future similar cooperation, and to further assure same, he will review the Charter of Governance to ensure that both the Administration and the Senate are in compliance, and which will serve as the foundation for continuation of our positive collaboration.

***6.   SGA President’s Remarks:***

*The Chair introduced the new SGA President* *Raziel BenReuben, who succeeds*

*former President Denise Herrera. Former President Herrera graduated at the end*

*of last semester. The Chair congratulated the new SGA President, and on behalf of*

*the Senate, wished him well in his future endeavors as SGA President.*

* Welcomed everyone to the College Wide Senate
* Expressed gratitude for all the faculty and staff that helps the University be as great as it is
* Expressed the work that must be done to bring Hostos to new heights
* Stressed the importance of collaboration between the SGA, students, and members of the College Wide Senate
* Introduced new members of SGA and the College Wide Senate
* Offered thanks for being receptive to SGA ideas and feedback
* Welcomed members of the College Wide Senate to reach out anytime.

At the end of the SGA President’s remarks, the Chair congratulated him and reiterated his support for the SGA. The Chair also noted the cooperation of the SGA concerning the naming of SGA Senators as members of Senate Committees and establishing quorum at the Senate meetings.

***7.   Curricular Items:***

None

**8**.   ***Non-Curricular Voting Items***

As the four non-curricular voting items on the agenda consisted of four elections,

the Chair reviewed the applicable rules regarding positions that are appointed, and

for those for which an election needs to be conducted. He also reviewed the rules

concerning nominations, voting and determination of election winners especially

as concerns when additional rounds of voting would be necessary.

**a. Action 1: Election of One (1) Faculty Member to the Senate Executive**

**Committee (to assume the role of SEC Recording Secretary)**

* + - Floor opened to faculty for nominations.
      * Professor Diana Macri, At-Large Senate Representative, nominated and accepted the nomination
    - There being no further nominations nor statements by nominees, the Chair made a motion to close nominations and hold a vote, which motion was seconded and approved, and thereafter a secret ballot vote was taken.
    - **Action 1 Results:**  Candidate Prof. Diana Macri (sole candidate)

**For/Yes: 61 Against/ No: 0 Invalid: 0 Abstain: 2** Senator Diana Macri elected to the Senate Executive Committee. (immediately assumed the role of Senate Recording Secretary.)

**b.** **Action 2: Election of one (1) Student Member to the Senate Executive Committee**

* Floor opened for nominations; Mr. Raziel BenReuben and Mr. Brian Carter, SGA representatives nominated and accepted nominations
* There being no further nominations nor statements by nominees, the Chair made a motion to close nominations and hold a vote, which motion was seconded and approved, and thereafter a secret ballot vote was taken.
* **Action 2 results:** Mr.Raziel BenRuben 46 For/Yes

Mr. Brian Carter 15 For/Yes

**Invalid: 1 Abstention: 0**

Mr. Raziel BenReuben elected to Senate Executive Committee as a Student Member.

**c. Action 3: Election of 1 Faculty member to the Committee on Committees**

* Floor opened for nominations; Prof. Tram Nguyen nominated and accepted nomination
* There being no further nominations nor statements by nominees, the Chair made a motion to close nominations and hold a vote, which motion was seconded and approved, and thereafter a secret ballot vote was taken.
* **Action 3 results:** Candidate Professor Tram Nguyen (sole candidate)

**For/Yes: 62 Against/ No: 0 Invalid: 2 Abstain: 1**

Professor Tram Nguyen elected to Committee on Committees as a Faculty Member.

**d. Action 4: Election of 1 Student Member to the Committee on Committees**

* Floor opened for nominations; Mr. Raziel BenReuben nominated but did not accept nomination. Ms. Leydi Bautista, Mr. Brian Carter, Mr. Khalifa Diao, Mr. Reynaldo Martinez nominated and accepted nominations
* There being no further nominations nor statements by nominees, the Chair made a motion to close nominations and hold a vote, which motion was seconded and approved, and thereafter a secret ballot vote was taken.
* **Action 4 results:** Ms.Leydi Bautista **For/Yes 34**

Mr. Brian Carter **For/Yes 17**

Mr.Khalifa Diao **For/Yes 4**

Mr**.** Reynaldo Martinez **For/Yes 5**

**Invalid: 1 Abstain: 1**

Leydi Bautista elected to Committee on Committees as a Student Member.

***9. Reports of the Senate Standing Committees***

After reviewing the new procedures for CUNY Central to approve curricular items, Curriculum Committee Chair Sandy Figueroa took the opportunity to thank the members of her Committee, the faculty and the Senate Executive Committee for their hard work and effort regarding the preparation, presentation and review of curricular items.

***10. Report of Provost Christine Mangino on students and recommended credits taken per semester***

* 1.5 years ago, Hostos joined Complete College America initiative to help students complete degrees on time. Specifically, Hostos/CUNY focusing on encouraging students to complete 15 credits/semester.
* Lots of pushback from campus community because it’s tough on students
* However, lots of research supports the movement of encouraging students to complete 15 credits/semester.
* Provost presented data from Hostos OIR to support the 15 credits/semester movement
* Provost stated faculty are being asked to encourage students/facilitate conversations regarding students taking 15 credits/semester
* The Provost noted it is the student’s choice as to whether they take 15 credits
* Various faculty raised concerns/made statements:
  + Prof. Felipe Pimentel- wants to know more about profiles of student data cited by Provost
  + Prof. Gail August- requests more data regarding students who are able to complete 15 credits/semester
  + Prof. Iris Mercado
  + Mr. Carlos Diaz (student)
  + Prof. Craig Bernardini
  + Prof. Lauren Wolf- thanked the Provost for sharing resources

At this time Chair Ialongo made a motion to extend the meeting to 5:15pm. The motion was passed unanimously.

* + Prof. Sherese Mitchell
  + Prof. Alexandra Milsom
  + Prof. AJ Stachelek
  + Prof. Julie Trachman
  + Ms. Theresa Hammonds- students about to leave college report they had no idea that completing more classes per semester was beneficial
  + Ms. Jacqueline Lloyd-stated that getting proper instructions/directions facilitates completion
  + Raziel BenReuben- success in completing 15 credits/semester highly dependent on collaboration between all departments/faculty/students

Chair Ialongo requested all present return unused ballots and that all faculty/members who commented regarding Provost Mangino’s presentation to send a summary of their comments so that they can be properly recorded in the minutes.

Meeting adjourned at 5:11 pm

***11. Reports Submitted After Senate for the Record***

**a. Comments on Provost’s presentation regarding Credits Taken per Semester**

Provost Mangino

There will never be a single data point that gives a definitive answer to whether or not students could or should take 15 credits per semester as every student’s situation is different. The data shared today demonstrates that taking 15 credits is a successful (or viable) option for some students. I am also not suggesting that every student should take 15 credits. I am asking that we allow the students to make the decision in conversation with us about the benefits of keeping up the momentum in conjunction with their outside of class responsibilities and work schedules. The data does show that it is beneficial for some students and therefore the students should be informed of their options so they can make the decision.

Prof. Gail August

1. I thanked the Provost for acting so quickly on my comments at the last Senate meeting

2. We need to identify those characteristics that make the 9% successful, and advise them of the option to do 15 hours. (BTW it is not really 9% because of the high W rate, so we need a better number). But, we need to be careful not to railroad others into this choice if it isn't the best option for them. Also, we need to be careful not to stigmatize the 12 hour group or to suggest that they have less commitment or ability than those taking 15.

3. The 9-12 hour group are virtually the same, and we should also look to see who they are.

4. We need to analyze the stats for: Day vs. Evening students, Who works and how many hours, Family obligations

5. We need to be careful with the statistic showing that students who take 5 courses only one semester graduate earlier. We need to know which semester. My experience is that it is the last semester and they need the 5 courses to graduate, don't want to stay another term, and already have the kinds of basic skills and strategies for survival (success?) (And, from my experience, this is still very difficult for them, and not an experience they would have welcomed for two years.)

6. At the UFS some profs have privately remarked that students are being pressured to take 5 and then dropping a course--this may be a good strategy for some populations, but not necessarily a good idea for most of our students.

7. Our goal is graduation, but also education, and we need to find a way to help our students achieve both.

If Craig doesn't answer this, his comment was very important;

He commented on the signs and the advertising around the college, and felt that his was unfair and unrealistic pressure. It would be preferable to have the coaches advise.

What I didn't say:

The first thing they said about Felix Matos is that he raised the graduation rate at Hostos. CUNY, and specifically our current president, will be under a lot of pressure to improve the rate even more, and they will find some way to make those numbers say what they want.

I am very concerned about the numbers they are suggesting as a future graduation rate goal. We can only meet them by discouraging a certain segment of our student population and bringing in a younger, better educated, less encumbered population. This goes against our mission, and also against all of the wonderful publicity we got about being the best and most economic system to bring people from difficult socio-economic situations to places where they have opportunities for success.

Last, maybe I'm a worrier, but all of this this comes from the state. We need to preserve the "full time" status for Tap and Pell at 12 hours and to avoid a push to make it 15 hours. 15 hours is the rage--the excelsior scholarship, asap, etc.

Prof. A.J Stachelek

Dear Professor Ialongo,

Although I am not sure verbatim, it was roughly the following:

I would be very cautious in looking into sociological factors that we think might impede students in being successful taking 15 credits. I get very concerned when we start discussing who can or can’t do something based on demographics, as this rarely turns out well. I would hope that we can utilize the advisors to have these clear discussions with students so they can make an informed decision themselves. I myself was a first-generation college student and just didn’t know a lot about the system. I also had an individual suggest I not major in mathematics, but now I am here teaching mathematics at Hostos, so I personally shy away from making decisions about who can and can’t do something. I hope that I always encourage students that they can do what they strive to do and hope we are careful with considering how our beliefs may harm students.

Feel free to edit or omit as deemed necessary. The overall point was to leave the decision up to the student after it is clearly presented in an unbiased way by the advisors and that we avoid looking too much into demographics to dictate who gets access to these discussions and choices in the first place.

Prof. Craig Bernardini

I noted that there seemed to be a disconnect about how the step it up campaign was perceived, with the Provost referring to it as a "choice," and faculty as students being "pushed"; I noted that a less-aggressive advertising campaign, or perhaps no campaign at all, with the issue left entirely to success coaches and advisors, might make for a more authentic "choice."

I also noted that the data about GPAs going up vs down was ambivalent, as almost as many students were harmed as helped, or at least had to tradeoff between progress toward graduation and GPA; I suggested that, now that this data has been collected, OIR might look at how much students' GPAs went up versus how much they went down; this might give us a somewhat better sense of the impact on students who upped to 15 hours.

Ms. Jacqueline Lloyd

Dear Mr. Ialongo,

I speak for myself, other working parents and caregivers, when I stated that taking 15 credits per semester was not an easy task. Especially when you have other personal and academic issues to deal with. I did it and I was successful but I had the resources of ASAP to help me along, even with the resources it was a huge challenge. Just informing the students to do five subjects in order to graduate in 2 years will not work unless there are resources in place to assist them in doing so.

Prof. Felipe Pimentel

The question of taking 15 credits during a semester is something that we need to assess taking into consideration many different factors. It seems that about 9% of the total of students enrolled at the college are attempting to do that and about 73% (roughly) of them have been able to earn that number of credits in one semester. According to the data distributed at the senate meeting, these students have relative high GPAs and higher retention rates too. Obviously, students earning 15 (or even 12) credits per semester will graduate faster and will use their financial aid in more effective ways. Yet, the questions that we should consider are: what kind (social profile) of students are the ones taking and earning 15 credits per semester? Do they work full or part-time? Do they have serious family obligations? Are they more academically motivated than other students who have enrolled at Hostos? And like those questions, there are many other questions that need to be addressed before promoting a campaign to push all (or the majority) of our students to take 15 credits per semester. For example, if you are taking Math and English remedial classes or if you have a weak academic background, can you do the expected academic work required in 5 classes (3-credit courses)?

We need to screen the students that we are getting and identify those with the academic skills, the time and the motivation to take 12 or 15 credits per semester and be able to earn good grades in all the classes that they take. I am pretty sure that there are a good number of students who may be able to go that way and earn more credits per semester and graduate faster. On the other hand, there are also many students who hardly can do 12 credits per semester (for a variety of reasons) and it would be a bad policy to create false expectations in them about their chances of taking 15 credits and be academic successful in doing so. We should be cautious and move one step at the time, focusing on the individual academic needs of each student that we have. And we all know that their needs and situations are quite diverse.

Prof. Jacqueline M. DiSanto

Dear Ernest:

Here are my thoughts (I discussed this with my FYS students yesterday):

It is an excellent suggestion, but it is a suggestion because our students must consider their academic ability and stamina. Which courses are they thinking of taking together? Five heavy reading or writing courses can be as daunting as combining math and science for some, and others might find either of those their easiest combination. Factor in employment and family responsibility and the reality is that some can take 15 and others cannot. I think we would have more success graduating students in two years as opposed to four semesters if more could register for the winter and summer sessions. It is really a one-on-one decision made by the student. We must share the possibility with each student we advise and give them things to think about when deciding their schedule. I see more students interested in summer and winter coursework; unfortunately finances often stops them. PS I have had two students try the five course-workload in their last semester only to drop one of the courses because it was too much and they were worried about lowering their excellent GPAs. They decided longer was better than lower.

Prof. Ana Ozuna

Dear Professor Ialongo:

Thank you for providing us the opportunity to submit comments on this pertinent issue. I did not speak at Senate but wanted to express the need to expand college services particularly tutoring, writing support, and access to technology as we consider this initiative. Moreover, it would be useful to attempt to capture the profile of students who successfully earned 15 credits for two semesters or more.

Thanks again to the opportunity to contribute to this discuss.

**b. UFS Report**

UFS Report for Feb. 19, 2019 Plenary Session

A. Among our guests were SUNY UFS President Gwen King and Faculty Council of Community College President Nina Tamrowski. Their presentation included the following points: I)with new Chancellor and Provost in place, SUNY is looking to expand their online course initiative and exploring 3 different models: a)SUNY-led b)led by 1 yet to named campus c)vendor-led. The focus would be out-of-NYS, for ex. graduate programs that don’t yet exist yet at SUNY and they hope to pursue cross-campus cooperation. II)New Deal Resolution with respect to Maintenance of Effort (MOE) for both SUNY and CUNY: They hope all campuses will pass resolutions similar to the one passed at Cobleskill campus (more about this below) and reach out to Governor Cuomo by March 15. III)Evaluation of their 20 year old General Education initiative: They are generating a green paper with recommendations, which will go to a Task Force. They want to adapt their programs to 21st century needs.

B. Prof. Kerin Coughlin, our UFS Parliamentarian discussed further the proposed UFS Charter changes. Some of this was based on comments made at the last plenary and after last plenary. One change that had been suggested before will be reversed, which has to do with the role of the UFS. We will return to the original language and actually strengthen the language. Most of the discussion revolved around the UFS composition. Instead of using the word faculty, it was suggested to change the wording to “instructional staff” so as to be able to increase presence of part-time faculty and potentially include other instructional staff. This particular change will be separated out from the other changes with respect to voting so that the UFS can continue looking at this issue.

C. Prof. Ned Benton of the Budget Advisory Committee put forth a resolution regarding NYS and funding CUNY issues. The language will be tweaked but overall the ideas passed muster. We were encouraged to share this with our campuses for them to vote on similar resolutions and like SUNY’s resolution, asked to reach out to Gov. Cuomo and other governance leaders to ask for them to increase CUNY (and other public education) funding.

Prepared by Profs. Héctor Soto and Diana Macri