25 Broad Street Mount Holly, New Jersey 08060 May 4, 2012

Dr. Félix V. Matos Rodríguez, President Eugenio María de Hostos Community College City University of New York 500 Grand Concourse Bronx, New York 10451

RE: Final MSCHE Report

Dear Dr. Matos Rodriguez:

Enclosed with this letter is the <u>final team report</u> as a result of the recent reaccreditation MSCHE site visit of March 25-28, 2012. All suggested edits were carefully reviewed and accepted or rejected in compliance with MSCHE guidelines.

I am proud to have had the pleasure of working with you toward the reaccreditation of Eugenio María de Hostos Community College. Please accept my best wishes for success in all of your future endeavors.

Sincerely,

Robert C. Messina, Jr.

Robert C. marin Gr.

RCM/sld

Report to the Faculty, Administration, Trustees, and Students

Of

Eugenio María de Hostos Community College – CUNY Bronx, New York

By

A Team Representing the Middle States Commission on Higher Education

Prepared After an Assessment Visit to the Institution on March 25-28, 2012

The Members of the Team:

Dr. Robert C. Messina, Jr., Chair Former President Burlington County College

Dr. L. Diane Campbell Executive Dean for Student Affairs Mercer County Community College

> Dr. Judy E. Ackerman Vice President and Provost Montgomery College

Thomas R. Hawk Vice President for Planning and Finance Community College of Philadelphia

Dr. Jacqueline W. Kineavy Senior Vice President for Academic and Student Affairs Passaic County Community College

Richard M. Muniz

Former Dean Workforce Development, Continuing Ed & Community Service

Middlesex County College

Luis J. Salgado Professor of Bilingual Studies Essex County College

Rhonda M. Spells
Executive Director, eLearning Services
Prince George's County Community College

Working with the Team: Tito Guerrero, Vice President

At the Time of the Visit: President/Chief Executive Officer: Dr. Félix V. Matos Rodríguez, President

Chief Academic Officer:
Carmen Cabelles-Vega, Provost/Vice President for Academic Affairs

Chair of the Governing Board:

BENNO SCHMIDT, B.A. J.D.

Chairperson of the Board of Trustees of the City University of New York

I. INSTITUTIONAL OVERVIEW

As one of 24 units of The City University of New York (CUNY), Eugenio María de Hostos Community College was established in 1968 when a diverse group of community leaders, students, educators, activists and elected officials demanded the creation of a higher education space to meet the needs of the South Bronx. Its founding constituted the first occasion in New York that a two-year, public, open admissions, transitional language learning college was deliberately sited in a neighborhood like the South Bronx, then, as now, the nation's poorest congressional district.

Established to make higher education accessible in one of New York City's most neglected communities influences everything that happens on campus, including the determination with which faculty and staff adheres to the college-wide mission. Hostos' mission is a forthright description of what it sees as its charge. Not only does it shed light on the complex challenges its students face in their pursuit of higher education, but it also guides the way in which it helps students achieve success on their diverse learning paths. Additionally, it helps faculty, staff, and administrators bridge the past with the present, and an eye to the future so that the college remains grounded in its historical roots while also seeking to become a dynamic and transformative institution.

With 6 buildings at East 149th Street and the Grand Concourse, and shared sites in Washington Heights (CUNY in the Heights) and the Grand Concourse and Fordham Road (CUNY on the Concourse), Hostos offers 27 degree options and certificate programs, including academic transfer, and vocational/technical training, as well as numerous non-credit continuing education offerings. As a CUNY college, its academic programs are accredited both by the Middle States Commission on Higher Education and the Board of Regents of the University of the State of New York, as well as numerous other accrediting bodies such as the New York Department of Health and the American Dental Association.

Hostos also serves as a hub for numerous community and cultural events. Community groups and government agencies frequently use its facilities to present their programs to the neighboring community. The Hostos Center for the Arts and Culture, which first opened its doors in 1982, is an events venue for cultural experiences that affirm and nurture the ethnic heritages of the communities the college serves. Over 2,000 campus-wide events are held each year in collaboration with the community. About three hundred of these events each year are hosted by the Arts Center, which includes two theatres and the Art Gallery. For example, Hostos co-sponsors the Dream Big Initiative with the Bronx Children's Museum which works with children from local community-based programs and motivates youngsters to dream big and work hard to accomplish their goals.

Over the past 10 years, enrollment at Hostos has almost doubled. According to Fall 2010 data, Hostos' unduplicated headcount was 6,499, with 4,651 FTE's. Additionally, the number of adult and continuing education students has grown by 440% since 1999-2000, from 1,999 to 10,802 in 2009-10. Students are predominantly Hispanic, and speak a language other than English at home. While upwards of 90% of students indicate their home language is other than English, the same percent indicate that they are equally comfortable in both English and their home language. An important student demographic trend to note is the growing percentage of incoming freshmen with U.S. high school diplomas. Hostos is increasingly serving 1.5 generation students: that is children of immigrants who speak a language other than English, who may identify with their 'home country,' but were born in the U.S. and attended a U.S. high school. Still, many students enter Hostos with GEDs or foreign high school diplomas. In the Fall of 2010, one hundred and twenty countries and territories were represented in the Hostos student body and those students in turn spoke 78 languages.

Hostos students face serious economic and educational challenges to their pursuit of higher education. The large majorities of the student population (over 70%) has household incomes below \$30,000 and are eligible for financial aid. Over 85% of Hostos students require developmental or remedial education in reading, writing, or math, and one third of all 'students require it in all three areas. Hostos has the highest percentage of developmental/remedial students in the CUNY system, and educates about half of CUNY's triple developmental/remedial student population.

In the Fall of 2010, Hostos employed 402 faculty (181 full-time faculty, 221 adjuncts), and over 520 full-time staff members. Fifty-three percent of full-time faculty hold a Ph.D. or Ed.D. and 47% have earned master's degrees. Additionally, ninety-two percent of the faculty is tenured or tenure track. More than 50% of full-time faculty represent racial/ethnic minority groups (32% Hispanic/Latino, 11% African-American, 8% Asian), with an almost even balance between male and female faculty.

II. CONTEXT AND NATURE OF THE VISIT

HCC has chosen the comprehensive design of self-study to allow an in-depth study of each standard. The Self-Study process at the college was inclusive; it invited input from students, faculty, staff and administrators, as well as the local community. There was wide participation in the discussion, preparation and the writing of HCC's Self-Study.

From the team's meetings with the HCC steering committee, student body, faculty, staff, administration, community members and with representatives of the CUNY Trustees, and based on the team's reading of the self-study, it is apparent that HCC viewed its self-study as an

opportunity to both solidify and grow its commitment to the students and the community that they serve.

III. AFFIRMATION OF CONTINUED COMPLIANCE WITH REQUIREMENTS OF AFFILIATION

Based on review of the Self-Study, interviews, the certification statement supplied by the institution and/or other institutional documents, the team affirms that the institution continues to meet the requirements of affiliation in *Characteristics of Excellence*.

IV. COMPLIANCE WITH FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS; ISSUES RELATIVE TO STATE REGULATORY OR OTHER ACCREDITING AGENCY REQUIREMENTS

Based on review of the self-study, certification by the institution, other institutional documents, and interviews, the team affirms that the institution's Title IV cohort default rate is within federal limits. The institution meets relevant requirements under the Higher Education Opportunity Act of 2008.

V. EVALUATION OVERVIEW

- The college and administration along with institutional advancement should be commended for its ability to attract funds to the HCC Foundation and other granting agencies with which to support the students and the college. The Alumni Association should be commended for increasing the awareness of college achievements in order to increase college funding.
- Hostos is connected to the South Bronx community by providing a bridge to higher education through collaboration with groups within the community and through networking with businesses and governmental agencies.
- The Physical Plant should be commended for their excellent upkeep of a" Hostos facilities with limited resources.
- The faculty is to be commended for their concern and commitment to the students both in and out of the classroom.
- Hostos should be commended for dedicating resources in difficult economic times with which to provide faculty and staff with training and technology.
- The Hostos President and administration should be commended for their judicious allocation of resources in such difficult economic times.

- The team applauds the college for creating a vital student centered environment and for offering innovative programming which fosters student success.
- The team applauds the faculty for valuing professional development in both technology and educational assessment.

VI. COMPLIANCE WITH ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

STANDARD 1 (MISSION AND GOALS)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

The Mission of Eugenio María de Hostos Community College is to offer access to higher education leading to intellectual growth and socio-economic mobility through the development of linguistic, mathematical, technological, and critical thinking proficiencies needed for lifelong learning and for success in a variety of programs including careers, liberal arts, transfer, and those professional programs leading to licensure.

The primary focus of Hostos' well articulated mission' is to serve the population of the South Bronx. The mission statement was last updated in 2002 through a process that included all constituent groups. The mission clearly defines the college's purpose, the students whom it serves, and what it intends to accomplish. Moreover, the goals, activities, and outcomes of Hostos' new 2011-16 Strategic Plan clearly specify how Hostos will fulfill its mission. The mission statement is posted on the college's web pages, in the Academic Bulletin, is central to the Strategic Plan publication, and is similarly highlighted in the President's Annual Report. The mission is also integrated in divisional mission statements and plans throughout the college, and is supported by a diverse offering of 24 degree and 3 certificate programs, a large menu of work force development activities, continuing education opportunities, community service offerings, community collaborations, and student support services. Like the mission statement the new series of strategic goals, activities, and outcomes were fully participatory and include five-year outcomes as well as annual performance indicators that will shape ongoing evaluation practices.

□Commendation:

 We commend the college staff/faculty for their continued support of the mission, and for incorporating its goals in divisional/departmental mission statements.

☐ Suggestions:

- Conduct regular and systemic reviews of how college activities reflect the six major mission themes
- Engage and document more activities to encourage intercultural dialogue and multicultural learning
- Continue to draw on the strength of the college's multiple constituencies in order to translate strategic goals into programs, courses, and initiatives

☐ Recommendations:

The extent to which bilingual, developmental, and ESL offerings address the needs of the
community it serves warrants further examination since there are demographic changes
taking place in the college's service area. Recommendations for improvement center on
ways to deepen assessment of how activities across the college reflect mission themes as
well as how to ensure an ongoing commitment to multiculturalism and diverse
constituency engagement.

STANDARD 2 (PLANNING. RESOURCE ALLOCATION. AND INSTITUTIONAL RENEWAL)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

The current strategic plan was created in 2011 and extends through 2016. The plan was created in a manner that provided multiple opportunities for broad-based internal and external constituent input. The plan is explicitly tied to the college's mission statement, and is intended to create a framework through which all institutional planning and institutional assessment can be fully coordinated with the strategic directions for the College set forth in the 2011-16 Plan.

In developing the new strategic plan the College achieved a better understanding of its core strengths and challenges which served to inform the plan's strategic drivers. (Plan pp.9-10) Additionally, a wide range of institutional assessment information was also used to help shape the strategic drivers. The plan is focused on five goal areas that directly relate to the institutional mission: Integrated Teaching and Learning Programs and Supports; Campus and Community Leadership; Culture of Continuous Improvement and Innovation; Workforce Development for a 21st Century Economy; and Institutional Infrastructure and Advancement. For each section of the plan, strategies, five year outcomes, and key performance indicators are

identified. An over-arching expectation is that future divisional planning will be aligned with the directions established in the strategic plan.

Over 85 percent of the entering students at Hostos require developmental and/or remedial course work. A critical issue in the new Strategic Plan is rethinking institutional approaches to deliver these programs in order to assist more students to persist and graduate from college-level programs.

Budget planning is tied both to the College's Strategic Plan as well as the CUNY Master Plan. Annually, once city and state funding levels have been determined, each CUNY college within the system is provided an allocation based upon the College's three year weighted average enrollments. Based upon this allocation Hostos develops annual operating and budget plans that are intended to addresses both the objectives of the CUNY Master Plan as well as the college's strategic priorities.

The CUNY Master Plan incorporates a Performance Management Process (PMP) which establishes nine quantitative objectives to be met by each member college. These are intended to help guide college-level planning priorities and resource allocation decisions. Three-times-a year reporting to CUNY Central on the nine PMP objectives assists CUNY Central and college staff to assess Hostos' progress in meeting CUNY's objectives.

Prior to the creation of the current Strategic Plan, priorities in the annual budget were primarily established at the divisional level. Under the framework of the 2011-16 Strategic Plan, the College will move to a budget development process that is integrated and institutionwide. A college-wide budget process has been developed and documented (Self-Study, p.23) that supports the goal of integrated budgeting and planning.

☐ Suggestions:

- The most recent strategic planning process should be assessed to determine its
 effectiveness and to develop an understanding of how it can be strengthened in the
 future.
- College staff should continue to identify additional strategies with which to optimize the
 use of institutional assessment data in the college's planning and budgeting decisions
 making processes.

☐ Recommendations:

• The plan as written contains 'getting started' tactics for the first two years of the plan, but does not define a comprehensive five year approach to achieve each of the five major goals. On-going planning efforts should further define the steps that will be required to ensure achievement of the plan's goals. A critical component of this effort will be the development of a comprehensive approach to achieve the successful restructuring of the College's developmental and remedial programs.

STANDARD 3 (INSTITUTIONAL RESOURCES)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

Based upon city and state funding allocations to CUNY and three year average enrollments, Hostos receives a lump-sum allocation from CUNY Central. With the exception of some fixed cost and full-time position allocations which are budgeted and controlled centrally, the individual colleges have the latitude to utilize annual revenues in a manner that best supports the achievement of the college's strategic priorities and the goals identified in the CUNY Master Plan.

Funding for Hostos over the last half decade has been relatively stable and growing annually: In 2003 the CUNY Compact was established. The Compact is intended to help ensure that New York State funding for CUNY will be maintained a level that at least equals the funding of the prior year. The goal for the Compact is to eliminate significant swings in support levels that had previously characterized CUNY's funding model. As part of the Compact agreement, CUNY agreed to implement modest annual tuition increases (as opposed to periodic large increases), strengthen efforts to promote productivity and efficiency, and actively pursue new funding sources. Extra revenues generated by the Compact are to be applied to programmatic initiatives in the CUNY Master Plan. Hostos has benefitted directly from the Compact by receiving funding for ten new faculty positions, for expanded library collections, and for efforts to improve academic and student support services. The Compact revenues are anticipated to provide an on-going source of funds with which to advance institutional strategic priorities.

In 2004-05 the City of New York created a Community College Investment Program which has enabled Hostos to expand its full-time faculty by 17. Currently 70 percent of instructional hours are taught by full time faculty. (Self-Study p.36)

Revenue and expenditure patterns at CUNY colleges are monitored closely by CUNY Central. Failure to achieve revenue targets results in a requirement that a college under spend its

approved budget. Colleges may meet or exceed their revenue targets through a variety of strategies such as expanded summer school enrollments and increases in non-resident enrollments. Exceeding revenue targets enables colleges to overspend their original budgets and/or reserve these excess revenues for use in future fiscal years. Hostos has been able to utilize excess revenues to stabilize and strengthen programs and services over time and to undertake key facility renewal projects. Multi-year financial planning is in place to help the college to understand its evolving financial requirements and optimize use of available funds.

As part of the College's Compact efforts, the College has initiated private fund raising efforts. The Foundation (established in 2002) and the Alumni Relations Office (established in 2003) have raised \$1.34 million from annual fundraising events to support scholarships and academic programs.

A small endowment for scholarships and academic programs has also been created. Beginning in 2003-04 the college expanded its grant writing efforts and has raised more than \$6 million for its academic programs and over \$2 million for other purposes. (Self-Study p.35)

Effectiveness of resource allocation decisions is monitored in a variety of ways including: divisional year-end reports, PMP performance analyses, and Institutional Research Reports. The Self Study acknowledges that Hostos can strengthen 'assessing the effectiveness of the use of resources across the institution'. (Self-Study p. 30) The structure of the new Strategic Plan is helping to create the feedback loops needed to further strengthen the resource allocation process.

Faculty retirements are expected to have a growing impact on the college. The Enrollment Management Plan addresses staff planning on an annual basis, but a longer-term plan for addressing projected staff turnover does not currently exist. The anticipated change in faculty provides an important opportunity to reallocate teaching resources in a manner that best supports the college's goals to deliver new programmatic opportunities in the future.

Strengthened capital and facility planning is an important goal within the College's 2011-16 Strategic Plan. The Self Study acknowledges that the college could do a more effective job of connecting program and service planning with facilities planning. (Self-Study p. 35) In the past a facilities analysis was not required at the time a new program or service was planned. The last comprehensive Facility Master Plan for Hostos, however, was prepared in 1984.

Recently, CUNY Central authorized the college to proceed with the development of a new facility plan which is now nearing completion with the assistance of an architectural team. Examples of key facility planning issues that have been identified include: better utilization of existing space, expanding student common spaces, upgrading aging building systems, and

building new space to better meet the needs of current and future programs. Absent a formal facility plan, the college has used short-term planning efforts to resolve the most urgently needed physical plant needs.

Technology planning is supported through the work of two committees: Information Learning Committee (ILC) and the Technology Fee Committee. These two committees play an important role in setting priorities to support instruction and deliver student services. Efforts to date have resulted in a range of new initiatives. Examples of recent priorities include: enhanced library support resources, on-line tutoring and academic support, establishing and implementing standards for smart classrooms, expanding the open computer lab resources for students, and improving student and faculty access to information on technology. Hostos has been recognized within CUNY for its course-based technology innovations. (Self-Study p. 37) A Disaster Recovery Data Center is scheduled to become fully operational in 2012. A new Technology Plan to complement the 2011-16 Strategic Plan is currently being initiated as well.

The College is not audited as a separate financial entity. Central CUNY systems dictate the approaches used for financial reporting and budget controls. The university-wide financial audits do not report any financial management issues with College's financial operations. The A-133 audit did not disclose any significant issues at Hostos with respect to its management of federal funds including Title IV programs

Financial management and reporting procedures at Hostos meet the expectations of Characteristic Three. No concerns have yet been identified in the College's financial reporting, budget controls or management of its financial aid programs. Hostos has been a member of the small group of CUNY colleges who have been among the first to implement the PeopleSoft ERP, a CUNY-wide systems project.

□ Commendation:

- The college is to be commended for its effectiveness in actively developing and updating its technology and facility resources with which to address the evolving needs of the college. Older offices, classrooms and laboratories are being systematically updated and spaces repurposed to meet current instructional and service requirements. Well conceived technology planning is helping to ensure that students and staff have access to current technologies. The college is effectively planning for and has begun a successful transition to a new ERP, PeopleSoft.
- CUNY Central is to be commended for developing the CUNY Compact which has led to stabilization of funding in unpredictable economic times.

☐ Suggestion:

 Consideration should be given to developing a longer-term faculty staffing plan that will allow the college to achieve future faculty staffing patterns that support the college's capability to optimize achievement of its programmatic goals.

STANDARD 4 (LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

The seventeen member Board of Trustees of The City University of New York (CUNY) makes broad policy, pursuant to broader policy established by the Board of Regents of the University of the State

of New York for all of the 24 CUNY institutions. The CUNY Board of Trustees is a diverse group appointed by the Governor of New York and the Mayor of New York City. There are two ex-officio members from faculty and the student body. The Board appoints the Chancellor who is the chief educational and administrative officer of the CUNY system.

The CUNY Board Bylaws are available to the public on the Internet and include matters such as academic due process, duties of faculty and administrators, etc. The bylaws also provide for orientation of members and an elaborate conflict of interest policy. The CUNY Board also obtains funding and allocates the operating budgets. The President and executive staff are evaluated annually on the basis of the institution's progress on the PMP targets. The current president of Hostos was appointed to his position by the CUNY Board of Trustees in 2009. He has the authority to oversee the academic and administrative units needed to operate the college and fulfill the college's mission and goals. He is also a member of the Council of Presidents which is a standing committee of the CUNY Board of Trustees, which has been formed to insure unified and cooperative leadership in the city university.

The CUNY Bylaws direct that each college have a governance body. The College Senate is Hostos governance body and is charged with recommending college policy on certain matters. As such, the Senate has broad representation from all areas of the college. The Charter of Governance was last revised in 2008. There is a draft of a new charter that has gained Senate and CUNY Board of Trustees support. Additionally, the Student Government Association advises the Senate on matters related to student life, and is an active voice in the college

governance structures.

☐ Suggestions:

- The college should institute the recommendations and suggestions put forward in the Self-Study.
- Explore the possibility of restructuring the college senate into a model that includes and All College Senate and a Faculty Senate. Governance models should be reviewed at other CUNY institutions.

STANDARD 5 (ADMINISTRATION)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

The chief executive, Dr. Félix V. Matos Rodríguez, was appointed president on July 1, 2009. His biography is posted on the college's web page at the following URL: http://www.hostos.cuny.edu/oop/cabinet/fmatos.html. His academic background and professional training and experience are appropriate for his position. There have been significant changes in leadership since Dr. Matos Rodríguez was appointed. With the exception of the Senior Vice President for Administration and Finance who has been at Hostos for twelve years, the Vice President for Student Development and Enrollment Management who previously served as Interim Vice President and/or Dean of Students for ten years, and the Vice President for Continuing Education and Workforce Development who had previously served as Dean of Special Programs for seven years, the remaining five members of the President's Cabinet were appointed in the fall of 2009 or later. The bios on the web site for members of the Cabinet indicate that they have appropriate education and professional training and experience for their positions.

The most recent version of the organizational chart 5.1 shows the Hostos Organizational Chart. The Academic Affairs unit does not list individual departments and department chairs. There are two positions. There are two positions below Cabinet level that are either vacant or filled by an interim appointee. Additional information about the college's structure is found in Article IV of the Charter of Governance.

The administrative structure, illustrated in the table of organization, describes both the organization of positions within the institution as well as the functionality of a unit to achieve its goals. Given the significant amount of change that has taken place in the leadership at Hostos in the past two and a half years, it would be appropriate to intentionally assess the

administrative organization and its effectiveness for all areas in developing and implementing the 2011 - 2016 Strategic Plan. Similarly, it would be appropriate for the organizational chart to identify academic departments and their leadership structure.

The 2011- 2016 Strategic Plan indicates the intent to build leadership among students, faculty and staff. It is important that there be intentional succession planning so that when vacancies occur there are internal opportunities for advancement. Specifically, in discussion with the Provost, it was stated that this was particularly important to have ways to identify new department chairs.

It was noted also that in the past 10 years there has been an "increasing focus on accountability and assessment of administrative offices." In fact, the Administration and Finance Division regularly assesses each of its units. Now that there are permanent appointees in other areas this should become standard practice as well.

There is an acknowledgement that "Hostos' primary communications methods across administrative units need to be more formalized in years to come." The self-study (p.52) indicates that "This is a major priority in the 2011 - 2016 Strategic Plan - systematizing how administrative units communicate to inform decision-making so that feedback loops exist to strengthen programs and services."

The Self-Study recommendations for Standard 5 should be implemented.

☐ Commendation:

• The college is to be commended for fostering an environment in which the students feel comfortable with college administrators and find them approachable. Similarly, faculty expressed confidence in the president and other college administrators.

☐ Suggestions:

• Central CUNY Administration should provide as much lead-time as possible for the implementation of major changes such as information systems and general education.

☐ Recommendations:

 It is recommended that basic information such as the organizational chart and committee structure and membership be available on the college website. In so doing the institution will be as fully transparent as possible. Responsibility for keeping this current needs to be assigned.

- It is recommended that since assessment is of critical importance to institutions of higher education, it is critical that the vacant assessment coordinator position be filled as soon as possible. It needs to be determined whether an additional position beyond the coordinator is needed in order to carry out all of the course, program, general education and structure assessments that are necessary.
- It is recommended that each administrative area develop an assessment plan.

STANDARD 6 (INTEGRITY)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

While the college has been proactive in encouraging ethical behavior, more work could be done to communicate its importance. There is a range of CUNY-wide policies that address issues relevant to integrity across all constituencies. However, the implementation of these policies across different areas of the college is an ongoing challenge, and there is a heavy reliance upon the college

catalog and website for confirmation of existing policies and procedures. It is noted that there is an absence of a clearly defined student grade grievance process.

Hostos has clearly stated academic freedom principles in place for faculty that are regularly disseminated; and <u>faculty surveys</u> show relative satisfaction with campus support for free expression. The total number of filed complaints regarding academic freedom also provides evidence that academic freedom is being maintained. According to the Office of the Labor Designee, there have been no academic freedom grievances in the past five years.

Hostos has clearly stated academic freedom principles in place for students that are regularly disseminated. Hostos students' academic freedom is defined in the Joint Statement on the Rights and Freedoms of Students (updated in the 1990's). The statement notes that teaching and learning are complementary activities, hence the academic freedom of students and faculty are dependent upon each other; and that students need to be able to form "critical judgment" and to engage in independent study. The importance of academic freedom principles for students is also affirmed in the CUNY Board of Trustees' Bylaws, Article XV. "Freedom to learn and freedom to teach are inseparable facets of academic freedom." The Bylaws stress that "student participation, responsibility, academic freedom, and due process are essential to the operation of the academic enterprise."

☐ Recommendations:

- Student grade appeal policy and procedures must be clearly delineated and included in other publications, for example the Academic Bulletin.
- There should be clearly stated and accessible policies and procedures on racial, sexual and harassment matters.

STANDARD 7 (INSTITUTIONAL ASSESSMENT)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

HCC's attempt to build a self-sustaining culture of assessment began with the Hostos' 2007 Periodic Review Report (PRR). The 2011-16 Strategic Plan increases those efforts. This plan includes recommendations to strengthen assessment systems and feedback loops to resource allocation and planning. Specific recommendations include: increase the development and systematization of assessment activities, particularly in the non-academic divisions; expand resources for institutional assessment to further demonstrate the importance and centrality of assessment to the entire college community; ensure that Goal 3 (Culture of Continuous Improvement and Innovation) of Hostos' new Strategic Plan is infused across divisional operational plans; regularly survey graduates to determine their activities and status since graduation; and use course and program assessment findings clearly and systematically in resource allocation and institutional planning decision-making processes.

Hostos has implemented the General Education Mapping Tool which was introduced at recent CUNY conferences in their continuing effort to strengthen institutional assessment. In addition, the Division of Administration and Finance developed an "on-going assessment program" to inform the Division of Enrollment Management and keep them in the assessment loop.

The institution asserts that the Division of Academic Affairs has made "substantial strides" towards developing a culture of assessment and that as a result of their efforts many changes have been made in student learning, remedial/developmental education, persistence towards graduation, student retention, general education, facilities management, academic computing and late student registration. The office develops end-of-year reports with which to document annual activities on academic programs and other programs such as the Allied Health Department that are required to conduct periodic, external reviews.

The Office of Institutional Research (OIR) as well as external consultants has provided

the institution with on-going faculty and staff workshops with which to promote a cultural of assessment. In addition, OIR conducts numerous analyses for individual programs and other institutional issues and concerns along with presentations and explanations of research findings and their potential implications for the college community.

In addition, CUNY, as part of its annual Performance Management Process (PMP) report, requires institutional effectiveness assessment. As a member of the system, HCC is required to set goals and targets that assess programs and initiatives that relate to various issues and concerns with each institution (e.g. new programs, student performance, retention and graduation, assessment of operational efficiency and/or student satisfaction with individual offices, fundraising and technology). This effort has also impacted the development of HCC's new Strategic Plan which is based on outcomes data on student enrollment, performance and graduation.

Hostos has already undertaken course-based outcome assessment in 95 courses. As indicated in the new 2011-16 Strategic Plan, Hostos plans to complete course assessment on all college courses by 2016. OIR also continues to work with faculty to assist them in making course level outcomes assessment a tool that can continuously be used to inform and strengthen teaching and learning. There seems to be evidence of closing the loop in assessment findings effort with regard to resource allocation and planning in ENG 094, VPA 192, the Education Department, the Dental Hygiene program, the Office Technology program, and the Hostos Academic Learning Center.

☐ Recommendations:

- Hostos needs to increase the development of assessment activities especially in the nonacademic divisions in concert with Goal 3 (Culture of Continuous Improvement and Innovation) stated in the 2011-2016 strategic plan
- Develop a formal assessment plan that includes performance indicators with which to measure institutional effectiveness

STANDARD 8 (STUDENT ADMISSIONS AND RETENTION)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

Admissions policies are documented in the Academic Bulletin, in brochures and on the website, and are implemented and reflected through the mission of the college and its daily activities.

The college supports English language learners in its admission process through special immersion programs in which students can learn English prior to enrolling in college courses in order to facilitate a smooth transition into college with stronger language skills. The CUNY Language Immersion Program (CLIP) supports the mission and philosophy of the college. For example, when English Language Learners score low on the admissions tests, they are invited to participate in the CLIP program in order to strengthen their reading and writing skills prior to enrolling in developmental courses, thus affording these students a better chance for academic success. Students pay \$75 per semester for the experience.

Upon application to the college, students are invited to an admissions seminar, the purpose of which is to acclimate the students to the college as well as to provide information about the remaining steps for gaining admission. The admissions seminar also impacts the timing of the student flow into the admissions pipeline, and as a result some students are kept from having all steps completed prior to the start of classes should they not attend. In the seminar, financial aid information and regulations are explained, and students are invited to use the FAFSA lab to apply for financial aid and to learn about services and special programs like the College Opportunity to Prepare for Employment (COPE) which assists students in finding jobs. Thus participation in the Admissions Seminar facilitates the enrollment paperwork and financial aid packaging well before the start of the semester. According to the Director of Financial Aid and the Annual Report, 85% of students finance their education through loans, PELL and TAP grants, and scholarships which amounts to \$46 million dollars in aid.

Hostos has a growing pattern of enrollment. Evidence in the Strategic plan data prepared by the Office of Institutional Research supports a five year plan for continued growth. Presently, there are four recruiters who are responsible for outreach to high schools and community based organizations. The community is also involved in connecting students with the college. When the college has open houses community members bring students to the college to enroll them. Aware of the Hostos mission, families and community members help to facilitate and expose potential students to Hostos Community College regularly. Community connections are strong therefore and contribute to the growing enrollment. Moreover, the College Now program invites high performing ninth graders to begin college while they are in high school. Additionally, thirty-five students recently graduated from high school and college at the same time.

To retain students, The Hobson's Client Resource Management system assists college personnel by maintaining communication with students throughout the admissions process and beyond. Although there are numerous student support programs already in place at Hostos, plans are underway to acquire the Hobson's Retention program to establish better communication with students throughout their college experience at Hostos. Retention data is documented by both CUNY Central as well as institutionally.

☐ Commendation:

 The college is to be commended for its high visibility in the community as evidenced by the high schools and community based organizations that participate in numerous college activities. Effective partnerships with high schools bolster programs and help to facilitate collaborative efforts to address the high enrollment rates in developmental coursework.

☐ Suggestions:

 Consideration should be given to placing much of the information needed to access student services and programs in an easy to access format both online and in a small calendar type booklet.

STANDARD 9 (STUDENT SUPPORT SERVICES)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

Numerous programs and services support the personal, social and academic development of Hostos Community College students. Through student meetings and satisfaction surveys, indications were that students were pleased with services which include counseling services, health and wellness services, faculty advising, career services, new student orientation, Dean of Student's Office, transfer services, student activities, and new student advisement through the Office of Academic Achievement.

Five counselors offer support to students with personal and emotional concerns as well as mental health needs. Of the five counselors, four are licensed mental health practitioners. According to the Vice President for Student Development and Enrollment Management, the incidences of student mental health issues have increased. In addition, veterans are supported with services that are sometimes related to post traumatic stress disorder. Although counselors are accessible in the Counseling Center, they are expected to leave their offices and spend time in highly frequented areas where they are visible to students through a process called "Counselors on the Go." Counseling 1,000 students per year, counselors monitor challenges to academic resilience, such as eating disorders, depression, suicide concerns and drug, alcohol and other addictive concerns. They also facilitate conflict resolution or assist with relationship issues

Academically, over 85% of incoming Hostos students require developmental/remedial classes. One-third of students require three developmental/remedial courses. The need for developmental education/remediation coupled with economic limitations creates a need for programs that support students.

The college offers special programs such as the Hostos Success Academy, the Hostos Academic Learning Center, which is open six days a week, the CUNY Language Immersion Program and academic advisement. Advisement is offered on both Student Development and Enrollment Management (SDEM) and the Office of Academic Affairs (OAA). First year and incoming transfer students are advised by staff in the Office of Academic Achievement. Students in their selected academic areas are advised by faculty and full-time Advisors. In addition, programs such as Degree Works and the TAP Audit system provide guidance to students via computer technology. These and other academic support programs are listed in the Self Study document under T9.1: Methods for Identifying and Tracking at Risk Students (p.70).

Finances are another indicator of the high risk surrounding Hostos students. With 85% of students receiving financial aid in the form of loans, PELL or TAP, the need for student support that bridges financial gaps is apparent. Meals, transportation and child care are among the hardships for which students seek assistance. The Single Stop program supports students and was noted as an especially helpful program. The program provides assistance for lunch if a student is without money, housing, legal assistance and tax support. If students have difficulty with transportation, the Single Stop Program will provide a Metro Card for public transportation.

Through Career Services, students learn job seeking skills such as resume writing and networking at job fairs. Through the College Opportunity to Prepare for Employment (COPE) program students have opportunities for jobs. The program is in collaboration with the Family Independence Administration and funded and operated by the City of New York Human Resource Administration.

Students have opportunities to provide support for each other. Students in the Social Services program offer peer support for veterans. Other students serve as peer mentors, peer advisors and tutors. They are paid either through college work-study or through other grant programs.

Because many students are parents, the college operates a child care center five days per week from 9am until 2:30 pm. In interviews and meetings with student leaders, indications of overall satisfaction with Hostos Community College were apparent.

State level student grievance procedures were online, in the Academic Bulletin and in the revised student handbook. Many of the CUNY grievance procedures assign the grievance process to the college to carry out. However, Hostos did not have grievance procedures crafted to process student complaints in a format that students can easily read and understand. When there are grievances, they are logged in through the student development office but the next steps remain unclear.

Policies, grievance procedures and other pertinent information are contained in the student handbook found on-line under **Student Life** on the Hostos website. FERPA policies, Sexual Harassment policies and Academic Integrity Policies are also in the print version of the student handbook which is under revision.

☐ Commendation:

- The college is to be commended for its student support structure which is accessible to students who need help. Students know which services are available and they have a positive outlook about their educational pursuits because of the services.
- The college is to be commended for staff's implicit understanding of the institutional mission and the needs of the students served. It is clear that programs and services are designed and developed to support the Hostos student population.

☐ Suggestions:

 Though the Office of Institutional Research captures retention data and the Student Development Office surveys students online, assessment related to student development is needed. Measures of student adaptation to new technology, the impact of counseling on the retention of students who use the service, and assessment of special groups and their resilience in their academic pursuits are warranted.

☐ Recommendations:

 The student grievance procedures should appear in both the student handbook and the academic bulletin in a format that is both readable and understandable to students and guarantees them due process.

STANDARD 10 (FACULTY)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

Hostos employs 402 faculty (181 full-time faculty, 221 adjuncts), and over 520 full-time staff members. The Hostos faculty is appropriately credentialed. Fifty-three percent of full-time faculty hold a Ph.D. or Ed.D. and 47% have earned master's degrees. Ninety-two percent of them are either tenured or tenure track faculty. More than 50% of full-time faculty represent racial/ethnic minority groups (32% Hispanic/Latino, 11% African-American, 8% Asian), with an almost even balance between male and female instructional staff. Hostos also maintains a faculty handbook which serves a resources and information repository for HCC faculty members.

Hostos faculty have an impressive track record of grant awards, publications, and conference presentations in a broad range of pedagogical areas. Staff members are frequently called upon to present at national and regional professional association conferences and participate in a variety of diverse task forces to improve administrative practice in their field areas of expertise.

Hostos attracts high caliber professionals who want to make a difference in the lives of students who desire to achieve, but who face major obstacles in their pursuit of higher education. It is significant to note that Hostos enjoys a high faculty retention rate because of the tremendous rewards and satisfaction that come with being part of such a dedicated academic community.

The Hostos administration uses a five-component process for faculty reappointment, tenure and promotion through the use of classroom observations, student evaluations, faculty activity report, and annual evaluations by chairs and professional portfolios.

☐ Recommendations:

- The college should consider the development of a Faculty Council to discuss issues with regard to curriculum, the recommendation of new programs, program assessment and other faculty issues. This recommendation would not replace the present College Senate; rather both bodies would exist as in other CUNY colleges.
- A long-term plan for addressing faculty retirements needs to be developed. Faculty
 retirements are expected to have a growing impact on the college's human resources.
 The adoption of a succession plan will provide an important opportunity to redeploy
 teaching resources in a manner to support the college's goals to deliver newly
 developed programs.

STANDARD 11 (EDUCATIONAL OFFERINGS)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to this standard:

- Hostos Community College offers a range of career and transfer programs. It is evident that
 the college's educational offerings display academic content, rigor, and coherence that are
 appropriate to its mission to "provide access to higher education for all who need it." The
 program offerings are advertised on the college's website and in the Academic Bulletin.
- It is evident that full-time faculty are engaged in curricula creation, implementation, review, modification and updating, as indicated by the charge of the College-Wide Curriculum Committee. Ultimately, the Curriculum Committee is responsible for establishing and maintaining standards and integrity of the College curricula.
- The college's Office of Transfer Services uses workshops, transfer fairs, website and the "My Transfer Plan" booklet to inform students of transfer options. Additionally, the CUNY Pathways initiative is underway to establish transparent transfer between all CUNY institutions.
- A comprehensive procedure and schedule for APR exist, but has been minimal since 2001.
 During the period 2001-2011, the college reviewed five of the 26 degree programs-three of
 which were Allied Health career programs with required review by program accreditors. In
 AY2011-2012, only two additional non-career programs were scheduled for review. In sum,
 during the period 2001-2012, only four noncareer programs would have undergone
 program review.
- A variety of learning support services, including library, computer labs, eTutoring, workshops and online video tutorials are available to Hosto's students. Additionally, learning communities address specific needs of Hostos' diverse student body. Student satisfaction with learning support services is measured using the CUNY Student Experience Survey which reports high levels of student satisfaction with most of the learning support services. These services are communicated to students via New Student Orientation and the college's website. Many of the support services are available for students seven days per week.
- Library books and electronic resources fully support the academic programs.
 Additionally, the library provides a variety of services to support students, including workshops and the laptop and calculator loaner programs.
- Information literacy is integrated into the curriculum through two required writing courses and two additional writing intensive courses. The requirement for students to take two writing intensive courses is not clearly stated in the Academic Bulletin. The library is integral to the Information Literacy program at Hostos. The library offers information literacy workshops and course-integrated sessions throughout the year.

• The college has expanded its hybrid course offerings since 2001. The college offers 98 courses in either an asynchronous or hybrid format.

☐ Recommendation:

 A comprehensive procedure and schedule for Academic Program Review (APR) exists, but has been minimal since 2001. The college should implement the program review cycle to ensure regular review of both career and non-career programs.

STANDARD 12 (GENERAL EDUCATION)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

The self-study acknowledges that five years ago Hostos was just initiating a "general education practice." The Hostos Community College 2011 - 2016 Strategic Plan addresses general education in the context of Goal Area #3 - Culture of Continuous Improvement and Innovation, Initiative 3 - Assess Student Learning Outcomes, Including a Focus on Gen Ed. It appears that more recent efforts have been directed to defining general education goals for students along with 19 general education core competencies/learning competencies. The intent is that these goals and competencies *list* retch across the curriculum." They address the areas defined by the Middle States general education competencies of oral and written communication, scientific and quantitative reasoning, critical analysis and reasoning, and technology as well as additional competencies related to global citizenship and academic literacy and inquiry skills. Their Global Citizenship competencies are appropriate to the mission at Hostos.

A new CUNY initiative known as CUNY Pathways will bring consistency to general education across all CUNY institutions and insure transferability for community college students. The 19 competencies at Hostos will need to be mapped to this new program, but this should not be a problem.

Until the fall of 2010 the CUNY Proficiency Examination (CPE) was administered to students throughout CUNY who had completed at least 45 credits. A satisfactory score was a requirement for graduation and transfer. The CPE was focused primarily on written communication and quantitative reasoning and interpretation and did not include assessment of other competencies. It is not clear that there is anything presently used to consistently demonstrate that students have proficiency in the General Education Competencies. A

few faculty members are piloting e-portfolios and their potential to demonstrate that students have acquired these competencies. However, it is anticipated that the use of e-portfolios will take considerable time to implement since they have to evaluate their students' progress on acquiring the 19 competencies. Hostos has also adapted AAC & U rubrics for evaluating general education competencies, but they are not used systematically or consistently; the results are not reported out and it is not clear how the information that is obtained is used. It does not appear that there is currently a widespread plan to assess student acquisition of general education in place

A General Education Mapping Tool is used to identify which General Education Competencies faculty believes that they have included in their syllabi and assessed in their classes. Students are asked to indicate which activities that were designed to develop General Education Competencies have been included in their course. It is reported by the General Education Committee that it is a challenge to get faculty and students to complete the General Education Mapping Tool. It is not clear how the information that is obtained is used.

The general education program/competencies are not included in the 2010 - 2012 Academic Bulletin. However, one of the CUNY Performance Management Process (PMP) Objectives is to, "Ensure that all students receive a quality general education and effective instruction." In searching the Hostos web site, the 19 General Education Core Competencies/Learning Goals were found in the CTL section under Academic Affairs. This section also included a brochure for faculty about general education and the "A Student Guide to General Education at Hostos Community College" publication. This information needs to be more visible to the Hostos community. The language used to describe competencies should be consistent wherever it is used.

The general education program is defined by degree program with courses that need to be taken, not outcomes. It is likely that changes to course requirements will be necessitated by the new Pathways program.

The General Education Committee is committed to their work and has been developing a syllabus course template that would include learning outcomes and general education outcomes for courses. They anticipate finalizing this task shortly and then taking it to faculty in departments. They see that in the future their role would be to help faculty incorporate competencies in their classes and that this would be done at departmental meetings.

At the faculty forum, one of the faculty members indicated that there are opportunities outside of the classroom to include general education competencies as well and that this is happening in extracurricular activities.

☐ Commendation:

 The General Education team is to be commended for having gone beyond the scope of their committee to develop a syllabus template that would explicitly list course learning outcomes and general education competencies.

☐ Recommendations:

- Information about the Hostos General Education program and competencies needs to be included in the Academic Course Bulletin and should be easily found on the web site by students and faculty.
- Since it is anticipated that the implementation of e-portfolios will take a number of years, it
 is essential that a plan to assess student acquisition of the minimal general education
 competencies related to oral and written communication, scientific and quantitative
 reasoning, critical analysis and reasoning and technology competency be developed and
 implemented immediately. This plan should also indicate how the results will be used to
 inform instruction.

STANDARD 13 (RELATED EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITIES)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

Basic Skills

Hostos Community College has a significant population of students requiring developmental/remedial courses. The college uses this data to inform decisions regarding academic program development and planning. The college provides sufficient developmental/remedial courses as part of its educational offerings to support these students. The college employs a comprehensive testing and placement process to identify students who are under-prepared and require developmental coursework in reading, writing and mathematics. The College provides a variety of academic and support services and programs for developmental/remedial students via the math and English departments and the Hostos Academic Learning Center (HALC).

Hostos tracks retention rates and graduation rates for developmental/remedial students. As revealed in the self-study and interviews with the Provost and developmental/remedial English and math faculty, the college has established a priority in the 2011-2016 strategic plan to redesign developmental/remedial education to improve retention and graduation rates among developmental/ remedial students. The college has

secured a grant to assist with developmental/remedial course redesign.

Suggestions:

 Develop an effective integrated persistence and retention program for students taking developmental/remedial courses.

Certificate Programs

Hostos Community College offers four credit certification programs which are tied to credit degree programs and follow the same curriculum procedures for the degree program. Certificate programs are developed and approved using the same process as degree programs. These programs are scheduled for review along with their degree counterpart as part of the Academic Program Review program.

☐ Recommendation:

 In light of workforce development and other needs in the community, partnerships should be explored to increase the number of blended certificate programs that involve both academic and workforce skills.

Experiential Learning

The college has a Prior Learning Assessment Policy; however given the population of students, the college has a very small experiential learning program.

Non-credit Offerings

The College's Continuing Education and Workforce Development Division is focused on supporting the needs of the local community through lifetime learning and workforce skills development programming. This area has experienced tremendous growth since 1999 and continues to offer a variety of non-credit courses and certificate programs to provide educational, career, and personal development opportunities for students. The non-credit certificate programs establishes a pathway for students into credit programs. Many of the programs are focused on job skills for underemployed citizens in the schools service area.

The area of assessment of non-credit programs is in its infancy. The addition of the Allied Health Director of Quality Management was a significant step toward establishing an assessment protocol for the non-credit Allied Health programs. This model will be expanded to other non-credit programs.

Suggestions:

 The college should establish more detailed measures of non-credit performance that undergo regular assessment.

Branch Campus, Additional Locations, & Other Instructional Sites

Hostos Community College offers non-credit program options through satellite offices in CUNY in the Heights and the Concourse. Both locations are staffed to offer non-credit programs that meet the specific needs of the site. The institution does not have any other branch campuses, additional locations or other instructional sites.

Distance or Distributed Learning

The College has expanded its asynchronous (online) and hybrid course offerings since 2001 and now offers a growing list of online and hybrid courses. Consequently, the college has experienced significant growth in hybrid course enrollments.

It was revealed through interviews that approximately 80% of the requirements leading to the Associate in Applied Science in Early Childhood Education (ECE) can be completed through study delivered by distance education. Of the 20 courses needed to complete the Early Childhood AAS degree, students can take 12 of the courses completely asynchronously (online) and 4 as hybrid courses (50% online instruction). The remaining four courses need to be taken on campus at this time. The ECE program was approved for delivery via distance education by the New York State Education Department in 2007.

Each academic department is responsible for its distance learning course offerings. Online courses and programs are assessed using the same procedures as traditional courses and are subject to the same evaluation process as traditional face-to-face courses. The faculty observation form for online courses was revised to reflect observation in the online modality.

The college provides training and support services for students and faculty engaged in online and hybrid courses. Faculty training and support is done via the Ed Tech department and the online/hybrid faculty liaison. Faculty new to hybrid course teaching instruction attend the Hybrid Initiative Training and are partnered with a faculty mentor as they transition to online or hybrid teaching. Prior to teaching an online or hybrid course, faculty must present their course to the Ed Tech Committee for approval. Student support is done via the Help Desk, online video tutorials and other website information.

The work done by the General Education committee to create standard syllabus template for all courses will be of great benefit to online and hybrid courses is finalizing a standard syllabus template to be used by all courses that should be used by online and hybrid courses.

The college verifies online and hybrid student identify through login credentials for the Blackboard learning management system. The online password reset process also supports verification of student identity.

Suggestions:

- Formalize and communicate the process and guidelines for approval and implementation of new online courses.
- Implement a quality assurance program, such as Quality Matters, for online and hybrid course and program development and assessment.
- Add online and hybrid course and program information to the Academic Bulletin so that students are aware of these offerings.
- Target online student support services, such as eTutoring and online library, to online and hybrid students as important resources for their success.
- A standard course template be adapted and implemented for all online and hybrid courses.

Recommendations:

- Establish and implement an assessment plan for the online and hybrid program to align with the hallmarks outlined in the Middle States Distance Education Programs:
 Interregional guidelines for Evaluation of Distance Education (Online Learning) document.
- The college immediately submits a Substantive Change Application to recognize the Early Childhood Education AAS degree in the distance education format.
- Establish an online orientation for students that provides an overview of expectations for online and hybrid courses.

Contractual Relationships and Affiliated Partners

The College reported a variety of partnerships to offer workforce training and youth after-school programs. Many contractual partnerships are offered at the CUNY in the Heights and other satellite sites. Given the number of non-credit contract and certificate programs in allied heath, the college brought on a director responsible for developing quality assurance measures across the continuing education Allied Health course and program offerings. The institution will benefit from extending this model to other workforce training programs.

STANDARD 14 (ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING)

HCC meets this standard.

☐ Summary of Key Evidence and Developments:

The College does not have an organized and sustainable assessment process to improve student learning. Although elements of a comprehensive plan are evident in current activities, assessment results at the program level are not available for the majority of programs.

At the program level articulated statements of expected student learning outcomes are not readily available to students for all academic programs. Published outcomes for discipline specific nationally accredited programs such as Radiologic Technology, Nursing and the Dental Hygiene program are in the Academic Bulletin. All other programs do not have outcome statements in the Bulletin.

Program outcomes for twelve degree programs were reviewed. There were no methods of assessment identified, but curriculum maps were available for these programs. Academic Program Review (APR) was reactivated in 2007 after a twelve-year period. Currently only four program reviews were available. All programs accredited by discipline specific agencies do have completed reviews (Nursing, Dental Hygiene and Radiologic-Technology). English and Education reviews were also available. There is a calendar for the completion of APR and policies on process and components of APR.

Assessment at the course level is progressing in an organized fashion. There is a timeline for completion of course assessments. Faculty are sharing results of assessment at faculty meetings and developing strategies to improve learning. Examination of ten course syllabi revealed statements of expected student outcomes. However, to insure consistency especially in multiple sections of courses, a standard course syllabus format should be used for all courses.

☐ Recommendations:

- Develop a comprehensive written plan for the assessment of student learning. The plan should include responsible parties and timelines The plan should also show the relationship of assessment to planning and budgeting
- Program outcomes must be clearly stated in behavioral terms and accessible to students, faculty and the public
- · Adhere to the calendar for Academic Program Review
- Use results from assessments of student learning to drive the planning and budgeting process
- Develop and implement a standard format course syllabus
- Offer professional development workshops to increase faculty expertise in the writing and assessing of student learning outcomes.
- Expand the role of the Outcomes Coordinator to include a direct reporting line to the President